



Please leave blank for completion by DS officers

EXECUTIVE DECISION RECORD

A1 Service Area	Programmes and Transformation
A2 Title	Managed Services for Temporary Agency Resources
A3 Decision Taken By	Deputy Leader/ Chief Officer
A4 Chief Officer	Please print name: Sal Khan Please sign name: 
A5 Deputy Leader	Please print name: Councillor David Leese Please: 
A6 Date of Decision	21 st December 2016.

Confidentiality

A7 Is this Decision confidential by containing exempt information as described in Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972?	No
---	----

Scrutiny

A8 Which Scrutiny Committee should this decision be submitted to?	(Please tick as appropriate) ✓
Scrutiny (Promoting Local Economic Growth) Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>
Scrutiny (Value for Money Council Services) Committee	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Scrutiny (Protecting and Strengthening Communities) Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>
Scrutiny (East Staffordshire Health) Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>

<p>B1 What is the Decision?</p>	<p>To appoint Comensura as Managed Service Provider for agency staff recruitment via call off from the MStar2 framework on a 2 year contract with an option of a further one year extension.</p>
<p>B2 What are the reasons for the Decision?</p>	<p><u>Background</u></p> <p>East Staffordshire Borough Council currently uses a Neutral Service Provider to engage temporary staffing agencies on behalf of the Council. This appointment was made by call-off from the ESPO Temporary Staff framework (ESPO Framework 653F MSTAR). This framework has been replaced by the ESPO Framework 653F MSTAR2, which the Council can now access for this service.</p> <p>In addition to reducing costs, the benefits of engaging a Managed Service Provider include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A single point of contact for the Council • Streamlining of invoicing • Structured management information and reporting – providing visibility of the temporary workforce and supporting wider initiatives such as demand management / workforce planning • Competitive and standard fees • Accuracy and transparency of charges and savings • Performance-based tiering of agencies to encourage service quality • Robust compliance checks – ensuring consistent compliance and reassurance around employment checks and safeguarding • Support the Council in addressing the requirements and operation of the Agency Worker Directive • Allowing access to a number of (tiered) agencies to ensure sufficient capacity and supply exists • A greater opportunity for 'local' and SME suppliers within the Managed Service Provider supply chain <p><u>Framework Overview</u></p> <p>The framework can be accessed by local government, central government, NHS and wider public sector organisations.</p> <p>The procurement process adopted by ESPO on behalf of MStar2 in setting up the framework was based upon the open tendering procedure as detailed in the European Communities Combined Directive (2014/S 243-428147), with award criteria divided into two areas; Price (60%) and Non-Price (40%).</p> <p>The framework is divided into 3 sub-lots, and the Council will be accessing Lot 1 – Neutral Supply Chain Management.</p> <p><u>Call Off Process</u></p> <p>An assessment of current usage data based on the proposed pricing of all the suppliers in Lot 1 has been undertaken (i.e. the Managed</p>

Service Provider fees, Agency fees and associated discounts) in order to identify the most suitable provider.

The assessment was based on the usage for the whole of the period 1st April 2013 to 31st March 2016 (i.e. the last three full financial years) for the job titles of temporary agency staff that are currently being employed (total of 88,200.36 hours). The assessment applied the proposed prices to this annual usage over a three year period. Where suppliers have guaranteed a percentage saving, this percentage has been applied to the full year's usage for the period 1st April 2013 to 31st March 2016 and subtracted from the estimated costs based on the Managed Service Provider fees and Agency fees. This assessment is summarised in **Fig.1** below. The spreadsheet showing these calculations can be found in Appendices 1, 2 and 3 and is summarised in Appendix 4.

Fig. 1 - Total cost identified of proposed scheme. (Based on past usage)

	Total cost identified of proposed scheme. (Based on past usage)	Cost
1	Matrix SCM	£ 57,039.75
2	Comensura	£ 61,411.87
3	Pertemps	£ 73,217.03
4	Randstad	£ 82,448.93
5	de Poel	£ 84,350.49
6	Manpower	£ 84,926.50
7	Reed	£ 94,340.32

Fig.2 below shows a summary of the estimated revenue that could be saved by moving from the current MStar framework to the new MStar2 framework. This is calculated at **£9,626.23** over a three year period. The spreadsheet showing these calculations can be found in Appendix 4.

Fig. 2 – Summary of potential savings following migration from Mstar to Mstar2 Framework - (Comensura)

	Comensura Total MStar	Comensura Total MStar2	MStar against MStar2 Difference +/-
Booking Fee	£16,758.07	£17,640.07	£882.00
Agency Fee	£55,729.80	£45,025.11	-£10,704.69
Discount	£1,449.76	£1,253.30	£196.45
Total	£71,038.11	£61,411.87	-£9,626.23
Cost of change	£ -	£ -	
Booking & Agency Fee minus discount	£71,038.11	£61,411.87	-£9,626.23

Cost of Change Programme

Fig.1 indicates that Matrix SCM are the cheaper option on booking and agency fees over a three year period. However we have also carried out a cost of change programme which indicates that in order to change from Comensura to Matrix there will be an additional cost of **£7,407.15** that would need to be included in the Matrix calculations. The spreadsheet showing these calculations can be found in Appendix 5. This cost would not be incurred were we to remain with Comensura. These costs are made up of pre-implementation costs, costs associated with the call off process, with the integration of the new booking system, with training of ESBC staff and the training requirements of the local agencies used by the new vendor*.

If we factor this additional cost into the calculations you can see that the Council would have to pay a further **£3,035.03** more than it would be remaining with Comensura. This is indicated in **Fig. 3** below.

* The estimated hourly rates used are based on the basic salary paid and take no account of on costs/overheads and productive hours. These would increase the hourly rate substantially, but would make no difference to the result of the comparison made.

Fig. 3 – Difference in costs between Comensura and Matrix following Migration to Mstar 2 framework

		Total	Matrix compared to MStar2 Difference +/-
Booking Fee	£17,640.07	£11,466.05	-£6,174.03
Agency Fee	£45,025.11	£46,149.87	£1,124.76
Discount	£1,253.30	£576.16	-£677.14
Total	£61,411.87	£57,039.75	
Cost of change	£ -	£7,407.15	£7,407.15
Booking & Agency Fee minus discount	£61,411.87	£64,446.90	£3,035.03

Recommendation

It is recommended that the Council call-off from the MSTAR2 framework to appoint Comensura as Managed Service Provider for provision of temporary agency staff on a 2 year contract with an option of a further one year extension.

Based on current usage, it is estimated that the potential saving will be **£9,626.23 (calculations shown in Fig. 2)**. This is through reduced agency fees as they will be fixed fees rather than a percentage of the hourly wage.

B3 What are the contributions to Corporate Priorities?

Value for Money Council Services. Reducing the costs associated with the employment of temporary staff.


B4 What are the Human Rights considerations?	There are no Human Rights issues arising from this decision.
---	--

Financial Implications

B5 What are the financial implications?	<p>The main financial issues arising from this decision are as follows:</p> <p>Whilst the methodology used is an effective way of assessing the potential for savings it does not predict the future ability to create savings which can be allocated against budget. Agency staff expenditure can be driven by vacant posts which are not predictable and are not budgeted for. Any additional savings will help manage the additional expenditure when required.</p> <p>The estimated hourly rates used are based on the basic salary paid and take no account of on costs/overheads and productive hours. These would increase the hourly rate substantially, but would make no difference to the result of the comparison made.</p>
--	---

Revenue	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19
See note above.			

Capital	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19
n/a			

The finance section has been approved by the following member of the Financial Management Unit:	<p>Please print name: Anya Murray</p> <p>Please </p>
---	--

Policy Framework

B6 Is the Decision wholly in accordance with the Council's policy framework?	Yes
B6.1 If No, does it fall within the urgency provisions (Part 3 of the Constitution)?	NA
B6.2 Has it got the appropriate approvals under those provisions?	NA
B7 Is the Decision wholly in accordance with the Council's budget?	Yes
B7.1 If No, does it fall within the urgency provisions (Part 3 of the Constitution)?	NA
B7.2 Has it got the appropriate approvals under those provisions?	NA

Equalities Implications

B8 What are the Equalities implications:
B8.1 Positive (Opportunities/Benefits): NA
B8.2 Negative (Threats): NA
B8.3 The subject of this decision is not a policy, strategy, function or service that is new or being revised. An equality impact assessment is not required.
B8.4 The equality impact assessment identified the following actions to be carried out: NA

Risk Assessment

B9 What are the Risk Assessment implications:
B9.1 Positive (Opportunities/Benefits): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ongoing financial savings from reduced management fees • A single point of contact for the Council and streamlining of invoicing • Structured management information and reporting – providing visibility of the temporary workforce and supporting wider initiatives such as demand management / workforce planning • Reduced and standardised rates of commission • Accuracy and transparency of charges and savings • Performance-based tiering of agencies to encourage service quality • Audits of agencies – ensuring compliance around employment checks and supporting safeguarding • Can support the Council in addressing the requirements of the Agency Worker Directive • Adherence to safeguarding matters and consistent compliance • Allowing access to a number of (tiered) agencies to ensure sufficient capacity exists • A greater opportunity for 'local' and SME suppliers within the Managed Service Provider supply chain

B9.2 Negative (Threats):

- Resistance from current agencies in accepting revised / reduced management fees.

B9.3 The risks do not need to be entered in the Risk Register.

Legal Considerations

B10 What are the Legal Considerations:

B10.1 There are no significant legal issues arising from this decision.

This section has been approved by the following member of the Legal Team:

Please print name:
Angela Wakefield

Please sign name:

(

Sustainability Implications

B11 What are the Sustainability implications:

B11.1 The proposal would result in an overall positive effect in terms of sustainability (including climate change and change adaptation measures).

B11.2 Positive (Opportunities/Benefits):

N/A

B11.3 Negative (Threats):

N/A

Health & Safety Implications

B12 What are the Health & Safety implications:

B12.1 A Risk Assessment has not been carried out and entered into Harriet for all significant hazards and risks because there are no significant hazards or risks arising from this decision.

B12.2 NA

B12.3 NA

B12.3.1 NA

B12.3.2 NA

Key Decision

B13 Is this a Key Decision?	No
Note: A Key Executive Decision is one where:	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. REVENUE – Any contract or proposal with an annual payment or saving of more than £100,000 2. CAPITAL – Any capital project with a value in excess of £150,000 3. A decision which significantly affects communities living or working in an area comprising two or more wards. 	
B13.1 If this is a Key Decision, is this an urgent decision such that a delay caused by use of the Call-in Procedure would <u>seriously</u> prejudice the public interest?	NA
B13.2 If yes, has the Mayor or in his/her absence the Deputy Mayor or in his/her absence the Chair of the relevant Scrutiny Committee agreed that the decision will be exempt from Call-in?	NA

NOTE: If this decision is subject to the Call-in Procedure it will come into force, and may then be implemented, on the expiry of 3 working days after publication – unless 10 Members of the Council call in the decision.

Please send the original signed document to andrea.davies@eaststaffsbc.gov.uk

Appendix 1 - Mstar Costs Against Estimated Usage Figures - Calculations (2013-14)

		Comensura			de Poel			Manpower			Matrix SCM			Pertemps			Randstad			Reed		
		Hours worked between 2013-2014	Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee			
		13,514.53	£0.20	£2,702.91	£0.26	£3,513.78	£0.35	£4,730.09	£0.13	£1,756.89	£0.15	£2,027.18	£0.17	£2,297.47	£0.16	£2,162.32						
		Hours worked between 2013-2014	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)			
Admin	Facilities Support Officer	815.00	£0.40	£326.00	£0.60	£489.00	£0.60	£489.00	£0.40	£164.00	£0.59	£480.85	£0.80	£652.00	£0.66	£537.90						
	Market Operative	1482.95	£0.40	£593.18	£0.60	£889.77	£0.59	£878.94	£0.30	£441.48	£0.59	£874.94	£0.80	£1,186.36	£0.80	£1,186.36	£0.80	£1,186.36	£0.80	£1,186.36	£0.80	£1,186.36
	Uniformed Services Support Officer	172.50	£0.45	£77.63	£0.60	£103.50	£0.59	£101.78	£0.60	£103.50	£0.58	£101.78	£0.80	£138.00	£0.90	£155.25	£0.80	£138.00	£0.90	£155.25	£0.80	£138.00
	Street Sweeper	367.90	£0.40	£147.16	£0.60	£220.74	£0.59	£217.06	£0.50	£189.95	£0.59	£217.06	£0.80	£294.32	£0.80	£294.32	£0.80	£294.32	£0.80	£294.32	£0.80	£294.32
	Refuse Loader	735.78	£0.40	£295.31	£0.60	£443.77	£0.59	£436.51	£0.50	£369.89	£0.59	£436.51	£0.80	£5,916.62	£1.10	£3,608.44	£0.80	£2,624.32	£1.10	£3,608.44	£0.80	£2,624.32
Trades and Operatives	HGV Refuse Vehicle Driver / Loader	3280.40	£0.80	£2,624.32	£0.90	£2,952.36	£0.80	£2,624.32	£0.55	£1,804.22	£1.05	£3,444.42	£0.80	£2,624.32	£1.10	£3,608.44	£0.80	£2,624.32	£1.10	£3,608.44	£0.80	£2,624.32
	Total			£6,726.60		£9,052.84		£8,670.61		£6,857.04		£9,482.56		£10,811.62		£11,658.89		£11,658.89		£11,658.89		£11,658.89
		Total Booking + Agency fee		£9,429.50	Total Booking + Agency fee		£12,606.62	Total Booking + Agency fee		£13,400.69	Total Booking + Agency fee		£8,613.92	Total Booking + Agency fee		£11,509.74	Total Booking + Agency fee		£13,109.09	Total Booking + Agency fee		£13,861.22
Generation of user		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	
Second generation		90/10	2%		90/10	0.75%		90/10	6.00%		90/10	1.00%		100% customer	3% - 5%		90/10	5%		90/10	0.75%	
		ANNUAL x 2%	£188.59		ANNUAL x 0.75%	£94.35		ANNUAL x 6%	£804.04		ANNUAL x 1%	£86.14		ANNUAL x 3% - 5%	£460.39		ANNUAL x 5%	£655.45		ANNUAL x 0.75%	£103.96	
		TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£9,240.91	TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£12,512.07	TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£12,596.69	TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£8,527.78	TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£11,049.35	TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£12,453.64	TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£13,757.26

League Tables

	Booking Fee	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 1,756.89	
2	Pertemps	£ 2,027.18	£ 270.29
3	Reed	£ 2,162.32	£ 405.44
4	Randstad	£ 2,297.47	£ 540.58
5	Comensura	£ 2,702.91	£ 946.02
6	de Poel	£ 3,513.78	£ 1,756.89
7	Manpower	£ 4,730.09	£ 2,973.20

	Agency Fee	Cost	
1	Comensura	£ 6,726.60	
2	Matrix SCM	£ 6,857.04	£ 130.44
3	Manpower	£ 8,670.61	£ 1,813.57
4	de Poel	£ 9,092.84	£ 2,235.80
5	Pertemps	£ 9,482.56	£ 2,625.52
6	Randstad	£ 10,811.62	£ 3,954.59
7	Reed	£ 11,698.89	£ 4,841.86

	Booking and Agency Fee	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 8,613.92	
2	Comensura	£ 9,429.50	£ 815.58
3	Pertemps	£ 11,509.74	£ 2,895.81
4	de Poel	£ 12,606.62	£ 3,992.69
5	Randstad	£ 13,109.09	£ 4,495.17
6	Manpower	£ 13,400.69	£ 4,786.77
7	Reed	£ 13,861.22	£ 5,247.29

	Total Spend Of Booking and Agency Fee - Savings	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 8,527.78	
2	Comensura	£ 9,240.91	£ 713.13
3	Pertemps	£ 11,049.35	£ 2,521.56
4	Randstad	£ 12,453.64	£ 3,925.85
5	de Poel	£ 12,512.07	£ 3,984.28
6	Manpower	£ 12,596.65	£ 4,068.87
7	Reed	£ 13,757.26	£ 5,229.47

Appendix 2 - Mstar Costs Against Estimated Usage Figures - Calculations (2014-15)

		Comensura		de Poel		Manpower		Matrix SCM		Pertemps		Randstad		Reed		
		Hours worked between 2014-2015	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	Booking fee	
		36,699.44	£0.20	£7,339.89	£0.26	£9,541.85	£0.35	£12,844.80	£0.13	£4,770.93	£0.15	£5,504.92	£0.17	£6,238.90	£0.16	£5,871.91
		Hours worked between 2014-2015	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)	Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)
Admin	Facilities Support Officer	40.00	£0.40	£16.00	£0.60	£24.00	£0.60	£24.00	£0.40	£16.00	£0.59	£23.60	£0.80	£32.00	£0.65	£26.40
	Cleaner	1707.00	£0.40	£682.80	£0.60	£1,024.20	£0.59	£1,007.13	£0.50	£853.50	£0.59	£1,007.13	£0.80	£1,365.60	£0.80	£1,365.60
	Facilities Officer	1052.00	£0.40	£420.80	£0.60	£631.20	£0.59	£620.68	£0.50	£526.00	£0.59	£620.68	£0.80	£841.60	£0.80	£841.60
	Locum Lawyer £31.13	638.00	£2.50	£1,595.00	£4.80	£3,062.40	£4.46	£2,845.48	£2.00	£1,276.00	£2.50	£1,595.00	£2.50	£1,595.00	£3.25	£2,073.50
	Market Operative	786.50	£0.40	£314.60	£0.60	£471.90	£0.59	£464.04	£0.50	£393.25	£0.59	£464.04	£0.80	£529.20	£0.80	£629.20
	Venue Officer	608.25	£0.45	£273.71	£0.60	£364.95	£0.59	£358.87	£0.60	£364.95	£0.59	£358.87	£0.80	£486.60	£0.90	£547.43
	Street Sweeper	957.15	£0.40	£382.86	£0.60	£574.29	£0.59	£564.72	£0.50	£478.58	£0.59	£564.72	£0.80	£765.72	£0.80	£765.72
	Refuse Loader	22917.94	£0.40	£9,167.18	£0.60	£13,750.76	£0.59	£13,521.58	£0.50	£11,458.97	£1.05	£13,521.58	£0.80	£18,334.35	£0.80	£18,334.35
	HGV Refuse Vehicle Driver / Loader	7539.90	£0.80	£6,031.92	£0.90	£6,785.91	£0.80	£6,031.92	£0.55	£4,146.95	£1.20	£6,031.92	£0.80	£6,031.92	£1.10	£8,293.89
	HGV Refuse Vehicle Driver / Loader (HRP)	452.70	£0.90	£407.43	£1.10	£497.97	£0.80	£382.16	£0.55	£248.99	£1.20	£407.43	£0.80	£362.16	£1.25	£565.88
Total			£19,292.90	£27,187.58	£27,187.58	£25,800.58	£19,763.18	£26,615.75	£19,763.18	£26,615.75	£30,444.15	£30,444.15	£33,443.56	£33,443.56	£39,315.47	
Total Booking + Agency fee			£26,632.19	£36,729.44	£36,729.44	£38,645.38	£24,534.10	£32,120.67	£24,534.10	£32,120.67	£36,683.06	£36,683.06	£39,315.47	£39,315.47	£49,920.61	
		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	
Generation of user																
Second generation		90/10	2%	90/10	0.75%	90/10	6.00%	90/10	1.00%	100% customer	3% - 5%	90/10	5%	90/10	0.75%	
		ANNUAL x 2%	£532.64	ANNUAL x 0.75%	£275.47	ANNUAL x 6%	£2,318.72	ANNUAL x 1%	£245.34	ANNUAL x 3% - 5%	£1,284.83	ANNUAL x 5%	£1,834.15	ANNUAL x 0.75%	£294.87	
TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS			£26,099.54		£36,453.97		£36,326.66		£24,288.76		£30,835.84		£34,848.90		£39,020.61	

League Tables

	Booking Fee	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 4,770.93	
2	Pertemps	£ 5,504.92	£ 733.99
3	Reed	£ 5,871.91	£ 1,100.98
4	Randstad	£ 6,238.90	£ 1,467.98
5	Comensura	£ 7,339.89	£ 2,568.96
6	de Poel	£ 9,541.85	£ 4,770.93
7	Manpower	£ 12,844.80	£ 8,073.88

	Agency Fee	Cost	
1	Comensura	£ 19,292.30	
2	Matrix SCM	£ 19,763.18	£ 470.88
3	Manpower	£ 25,800.58	£ 6,508.28
4	Pertemps	£ 26,615.75	£ 7,323.45
5	de Poel	£ 27,187.58	£ 7,895.29
6	Randstad	£ 30,444.15	£ 11,151.85
7	Reed	£ 33,443.56	£ 14,151.26

	Booking and Agency Fee	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 24,534.10	
2	Comensura	£ 26,632.19	£ 2,098.08
3	Pertemps	£ 32,120.67	£ 7,586.56
4	Randstad	£ 36,683.06	£ 12,148.95
5	de Poel	£ 36,729.44	£ 12,195.34
6	Manpower	£ 38,645.38	£ 14,111.28
7	Reed	£ 39,315.47	£ 14,781.37

	Total Spend Of Booking and Agency Fee - Savings	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 24,288.76	
2	Comensura	£ 26,099.54	£ 1,810.78
3	Pertemps	£ 30,835.84	£ 6,547.08
4	Randstad	£ 34,848.90	£ 10,560.14
5	de Poel	£ 36,453.97	£ 12,165.21
6	Manpower	£ 36,453.97	£ 12,165.21
7	Reed	£ 39,020.61	£ 14,731.85

Appendix 3 - Mstar Costs Against Estimated Usage Figures - Calculations (2015-16)

		Comensura		de Poel		Manpower		Matrix SCM		Pertemps		Randstad		Reed		
		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		Booking fee		
Hours worked between 2015-2016		£0.20	£7,597.28	£0.26	£9,876.46	£0.35	£13,295.24	£0.13	£4,938.23	£0.15	£5,697.96	£0.17	£6,457.69	£0.16	£6,077.82	
Hours worked between 2015-2016		37,866.33														
		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		Max Agency Fee per hour (£/p)		
Admin	Facilities Support Officer	495.25	£0.60	£198.10	£0.60	£297.15	£0.60	£297.15	£0.40	£198.10	£0.55	£292.20	£0.80	£396.20	£0.66	£326.87
	Catering Assistant	894.75	£0.40	£357.90	£0.60	£536.85	£0.59	£527.90	£0.50	£447.38	£0.59	£527.90	£0.80	£715.80	£3.25	£2,907.94
	Cleaner	127.50	£0.40	£51.00	£0.60	£76.50	£0.59	£75.23	£0.50	£63.75	£0.59	£75.23	£0.80	£102.00	£0.80	£102.00
Manual Labour	Facilities Officer	673.25	£0.40	£269.30	£0.60	£403.95	£0.59	£397.22	£0.50	£336.63	£0.59	£397.22	£0.80	£538.60	£0.80	£538.60
	Planning Support	249.00	£0.70	£174.30	£1.10	£273.90	£2.66	£662.34	£1.00	£249.00	£1.45	£361.05	£1.40	£348.60	£1.35	£336.15
	Toliet Cleaner	416.00	£0.40	£166.40	£0.60	£249.60	£0.59	£245.44	£0.50	£208.00	£0.59	£245.44	£0.80	£332.80	£0.80	£332.80
	Street Sweeper	45.00	£0.40	£18.00	£0.60	£27.00	£0.59	£26.55	£0.50	£22.50	£0.59	£26.55	£0.80	£36.00	£0.80	£36.00
	Refuse Loader	25855.99	£0.40	£10,342.37	£0.60	£15,513.56	£0.59	£15,255.00	£0.50	£12,927.97	£0.59	£15,255.00	£0.80	£20,684.74	£0.80	£20,684.74
Trades and Operatives	HGV Refuse Vehicle Driver / Loader	8779.01	£0.80	£7,023.21	£0.90	£7,901.11	£0.80	£7,023.21	£0.55	£4,828.46	£1.05	£9,217.96	£0.80	£7,023.21	£1.10	£9,656.91
	HGV Refuse Vehicle Driver / Loader (HRP)	450.70	£0.90	£405.63	£1.10	£495.77	£0.80	£360.56	£0.55	£247.89	£1.20	£540.84	£0.80	£360.56	£1.25	£563.38
	Total		£19,006.21		£25,775.39		£24,870.59		£19,529.66		£26,939.38		£30,538.51		£35,485.38	
	Total Booking + Agency fee		£26,603.49		£35,651.85		£38,165.83		£24,467.89		£32,637.34		£36,996.20		£41,563.20	
Generation of user		Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	Gain Share Proposal (% Customer / % MSP)	Guaranteed Saving (%)	
Second generation		90/10	2%	90/10	0.75%	90/10	6.00%	90/10	1.00%	100% customer	3% - 5%	90/10	5%	90/10	0.75%	
	ANNUAL x 2%		£532.07	ANNUAL x 0.75%	£267.39	ANNUAL x 6%	£2,289.95	ANNUAL x 1%	£244.68	ANNUAL x 3% - 5%	£1,305.49	ANNUAL x 5%	£1,849.81	ANNUAL x 0.75%	£311.72	
	TOTAL SPEND OF BOOKING AND AGENCY FEE - SAVINGS		£26,071.42		£35,884.41		£35,875.88		£24,223.21		£31,391.85		£35,146.39		£41,251.48	

League Tables 2015-16

	Booking Fee	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 4,938.23	
2	Pertemps	£ 5,697.96	£ 759.73
3	Reed	£ 6,077.82	£ 1,139.59
4	Randstad	£ 6,457.69	£ 1,519.46
5	Comensura	£ 7,597.28	£ 2,659.05
6	de Poel	£ 9,876.46	£ 4,938.23
7	Manpower	£ 13,295.24	£ 8,357.01

	Agency Fee	Cost	
1	Comensura	£ 19,006.21	
2	Matrix SCM	£ 19,529.66	£ 523.45
3	Manpower	£ 24,870.59	£ 5,864.38
4	de Poel	£ 25,775.39	£ 6,769.18
5	Pertemps	£ 26,939.38	£ 7,933.17
6	Randstad	£ 30,538.51	£ 11,532.30
7	Reed	£ 35,485.38	£ 16,479.17

	Booking and Agency Fee	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 24,467.89	
2	Comensura	£ 26,603.49	£ 2,135.60
3	Pertemps	£ 32,637.34	£ 8,169.45
4	de Poel	£ 35,651.85	£ 11,183.96
5	Randstad	£ 36,996.20	£ 12,528.31
6	Manpower	£ 38,165.83	£ 13,697.94
7	Reed	£ 41,563.20	£ 17,095.32

	Total Spend Of Booking and Agency Fee - Savings	Cost	
1	Matrix SCM	£ 24,223.21	
2	Comensura	£ 26,071.42	£ 1,848.21
3	Pertemps	£ 31,331.85	£ 7,108.64
4	Randstad	£ 35,146.39	£ 10,923.18
5	de Poel	£ 35,384.46	£ 11,161.25
6	Manpower	£ 35,875.88	£ 11,652.67
7	Reed	£ 41,251.48	£ 17,028.27

Summary of Mstar costs and MStar2 costs against estimated usage.
(Comensura)

	Comensura	
	Mstar costs against estimated usage figures	Mstar2 costs against estimated usage figures
	2013-2014	2013-2014
Booking Fee	£ 2,567.76	£ 2,702.91
Agency Fee	£ 8,397.47	£ 6,726.60
Discount	£ 219.30	£ 188.59
Booking & Agency Fee minus discount	£ 10,745.92	£ 9,240.91

	2014-2015	2014-2015
	£	£
Booking Fee	6,972.89	7,339.89
Agency Fee	23,475.28	19,292.30
Discount	608.96	532.64
Booking & Agency Fee minus discount	29,839.21	26,099.54

	2015-2016	2015-2016
	£	£
Booking Fee	7,217.41	7,597.28
Agency Fee	23,857.05	19,006.21
Discount	621.49	532.07
Booking & Agency Fee minus discount	30,452.97	26,071.42

Summary of Mstar and Mstar2 costs over 3 year period.

	Total	Total	Mstar against Mstar2 Difference +/-
Booking Fee	£ 16,758.07	£ 17,640.07	£ 882.00
Agency Fee	£ 55,729.80	£ 45,025.11	-£ 10,704.69
Discount	£ 1,449.76	£ 1,253.30	-£ 196.45
Total	£ 71,038.11	£ 61,411.87	-£ 9,626.23
Cost of change	£ -	£ -	-
Booking & Agency Fee minus discount	£ 71,038.11	£ 61,411.87	-£ 9,626.23

Mstar 2 costs against estimated usage

	Matrix	
	Mstar2 costs against estimated usage figures	
	2013-2014	
	£ 1,756.89	
	£ 6,857.04	
	£ 86.14	
	£ 8,527.78	

	2014-2015
	£
	4,770.93
	19,763.18
	245.34
	24,288.76

	2015-2016
	£
	4,938.23
	19,529.66
	244.68
	24,223.21

Summary of Matrix costs against Comensura Costs on Mstar 2 Framework

Total	Compared to MStar2 (Com) Difference +/-
£ 11,466.05	-£ 6,174.03
£ 46,149.87	£ 1,124.76
£ 576.16	-£ 677.14
£ 57,039.75	-£ 4,372.12
£ 7,407.15	£ 7,407.15
£ 64,446.90	£ 3,035.03

3 year totals for all suppliers based on new prices against past usage

A		B	
Booking Fee	Cost	Agency Fee	Cost
1 Matrix SCM	£ 11,466.05	1 Comensura	£ 45,025.11
2 Pertemps	£ 13,230.05	2 Matrix SCM	£ 46,149.87
3 Reed	£ 14,112.06	3 Manpower	£ 59,341.77
4 Randstad	£ 14,994.06	4 de Poel	£ 61,483.98
5 Comensura	£ 17,640.07	5 Pertemps	£ 63,609.52
6 de Poel	£ 22,932.09	6 Randstad	£ 71,794.29
7 Manpower	£ 30,870.13	7 Reed	£ 80,627.84

C	
Booking and Agency Fee	Cost
1 Matrix SCM	£ 57,615.91
2 Comensura	£ 62,665.18
3 Pertemps	£ 76,267.74
4 de Poel	£ 84,941.52
5 Randstad	£ 86,834.73
6 Manpower	£ 90,211.90
7 Reed	£ 94,739.90

D	
Total Spend Of Booking and Agency Fee - Potential Savings.	Cost
1 Matrix SCM	£ 57,039.75
2 Comensura	£ 61,411.87
3 Pertemps	£ 73,217.03
4 Randstad	£ 82,448.93
5 de Poel	£ 84,350.49
6 Manpower	£ 84,926.50
7 Reed	£ 94,029.35

2013-14	13,514.53
2014-15	36,699.44
2015-16	37,986.39
Total Hours	88,200.36

APPENDIX 5.

Change Analysis Costs - Summary

Pre Implementation Costs	£	2,925.80
Implementation Costs	£	3,594.85
Post Implementation Costs	£	886.50
Additional Costs		TBA
Total Cost	£	7,407.15

Pre Implementation Costs

Project Team Role	Likely Job Title	Est. Hourly Rate	Indicative Hours	Days	Indicative Cost	Tasks and Responsibilities
Procurement / Project Lead	Procurement Officer	£ 14.62	100.00	13.51	£ 1,462.00	Co-ordinating call off
Stakeholder	Operations	£ 17.73	75.00	10.14	£ 1,329.75	6 x 2 hour weekly meetings 2 Day interviews of bidders
Legal	Legal Officer	£ 19.15	7.00	0.95	£ 134.05	Review of access agreement
TOTAL					£ 2,925.80	

Implementation Costs

Project Team Role	Likely Job Title	Est. Hourly Rate	Indicative Hours	Days	Indicative Cost	Tasks and Responsibilities
Project Manager	Procurement Officer	£14.62	100	13.51	£1,462.00	Project Planning and management ~ 5 hours/week Weekly project meetings inc. Preparation and follow up ~ 3 hours/week Communications, understanding and explaining data capture tasks, stakeholder engagement, project team support and guidance ~ 2 hours/week = 10 hours/week
Project Sponsor	Head of Service	£42.72	5	0.68	£213.60	Initial KO, responsibility for comms, figurehead, driving activity.
Project Support - Operations	Service Manager	£24.43	20	2.70	£488.60	Collating data on current temps, providing detail for Org Structure, input on Job Profiles. Acting as conduit for information and questions for area of responsibility. ~ 3 hours per week Perhaps 7 people (one for each Directorate and key users)
Project Support - HR	HR Officer	£22.49	10	1.35	£224.90	Supporting with Job Profiles and Current Temps. ~ 10 hours
Project Support - Finance	Finance Manager/Officer Accounts Payable Officer	£19.15	5	0.68	£95.75	Invoicing spec and testing
Project Support - Procurement	Senior Procurement Officer	£18.00	20	2.70	£360.00	Review and sign off Benchmark
Stakeholder/C.Net User	Various	£15.00	50	6.76	£750.00	Training for all C.Net users. Currently East Staffordshire Borough Council has 74 Active Users, 3 hours per session (1.5 training and 1.5 travel etc.)
TOTAL					£3,594.85	

Post Implementation Costs

Contract Role	Likely Job Title	Est. Hourly Rate	Indicative Hours	Days	Indicative Cost	Tasks and Responsibilities
Contract Manager	HR/Procurement Manager Senior HR/Procurement Officer	£17.73	50	6.76	£ 886.50	Post Implementation Support
TOTAL					£ 886.50	